

R

A

F

T

~~SECRET~~

SECURITY INFORMATION

*SIE
SIE'S*

MEMORANDUM FOR THE DCI

SUBJECT: SIE-5: Soviet Air Defense Capabilities 1952-54

BACKGROUND

1. Initiation of SIE-5 was approved by the IAC on 1 November 1951 as a re-examination of a critically important subject on which much new evidence was available.

SUBSTANCE

2. The chief difficulty in SIE-5 has been a prolonged difference of opinion between Air Force and practically all of the other IAC agencies, particularly Navy and O/SI, over certain crucial aspects of the estimate. The result was a protracted series of working level and IAC Representative meetings in May, June, July, and finally September, ^{mainly} ~~largely~~ in an attempt to modify the paper to meet the AF point of view. During these meetings the other agencies accepted numerous compromises in an effort to secure AF agreement, in many cases reluctantly retreating from previously held positions solely to avoid dissent.

3. When several differences were still unresolved, O/NE called in three eminent technical consultants* to join the Board and hear the evidence of both sides. They accepted the AF point of view in some ^{few} ~~cases~~ ^{the majority of cases} and not in others, and support the estimate as now drafted.

25X1A5a1

~~SECRET~~

2025 RELEASE UNDER E.O. 14176

SECRET

4. Air Force now accepts the great bulk of the estimate, but ~~feels that the evidence is insufficient to warrant an estimation~~ still ~~objects to~~ ^{points} several major points (see attached AF dissent). The ~~other~~ ^{first} other agencies, however, have reached the limit of their concessions and we believe that ONI, O/SI, O-2, JIC, and State approve the paper as it stands. Moreover, O/NE strongly disagrees with the statement in the

5. RECOMMENDATION: (a) That SIE-5 be approved as ~~an appendage~~ drafted, with ~~an~~ ^{for the} appended AF ~~dissent~~. In the light of the prolonged efforts to reach full agreement, O/NE believes that further efforts would be useless, and that AF should separately express its views; (b) that the three appendices be published with the estimate, which ~~have~~ because of its classification will be issued in only a limited ^{distribution} ~~number~~ ~~of copies.~~

Attachment:

As far as I am concerned, it is apparent that messenger evidence has been used to establish a judgment.... without adequate consideration being given to substantial evidence. The whole long series of JIC Representative meetings and the bringing in of the outside consultants belies the implication that the other agencies did not adequately consider the AF points of view. The other agencies believe that waiting for "confirmed evidence" as the AF in some cases desired, would result in making SIE-5 not an "estimate" but merely a factual recitation of

Approved For Release 2000/08/29 : CIA RDP79S01011A000200020027-7 *opinion of the other agencies the proven local capabilities, or which AF seeks to cast doubt.*

Background.

1. - Initiation
2. - Much work - many meetings
3. - HD interim Bd Mins - because of technical nature of the audience.

NB

25X1A5a1

[REDACTED] membership
on the Bd known to & approved
by the agency in advance
of tenure on the Bd.

The Board of

Substance

all the agreed, except the AS, have reached

agreement on the present text. The AS, while
~~any~~ ~~not~~ ~~disagreeing~~ ~~from~~ ~~any~~ ~~part~~ ~~of~~ ~~the~~

paper feels that " --- "

The DI VSAC while not dissenting

from the paper "is concerned --- (1st s) ---"

(see DI VSAC ~~for~~ statement attached

for his full remarks in full)

That
I believe the weight of
present evidence to
is adequate to
sustain all the
estimates in the
paper